

APPENDIX D

EAST STREET SCHOOL COMPARATIVE CRITERIA

	UNACCEPTABLE	ACCEPTABLE	ADVANTAGEOUS	HIGHLY ADVANTAGEOUS
AFFORDABILITY				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> RFP requirement is that at least 50% of units are affordable at 60% AMI or less and a minimum of 10% of the units affordable at 30% AMI. 	<p>The proposal contains less than 50% of units affordable to households earning 60% AMI, or less than 10% of the units affordable to households at 30% AMI.</p>	<p>The proposal meets goal of 50% of units affordable to households earning 60% AMI, and 10% of the units affordable to households at 30% AMI.</p>	<p>The proposal meets goal of 50% of units affordable to households earning below 60% AMI, some units at 50% AMI, and 10% of the units at 30% AMI.</p>	<p>All units are affordable to households earning below 60% AMI, some units at 50% AMI, and more than 10% of the units at 30% AMI.</p>

	UNACCEPTABLE	ACCEPTABLE	ADVANTAGEOUS	HIGHLY ADVANTAGEOUS
DEVELOPER TRACK RECORD				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Demonstrated experience in and capability for designing, permitting, developing and managing similar affordable residential projects. • Experience in obtaining, structuring, and implementing layered financing for similar projects. • Ability to complete the project, including securing interim financing within 3 years • Track record of securing proposed financing. 	<p>In the last ten years, development team members have had only a minimal role in the receipt of funding and closing of any affordable housing projects of similar scope, including legal, design, development and financing experience with affordable rental housing.</p>	<p>In the last ten years, development team members have had significant and substantial involvement in the receipt of MA state funding and closing of two or more affordable housing projects and have experience with projects of similar scope, including legal, design, financing, and management; and have evidence of success in securing necessary financing in a timely manner.</p>	<p>In the last ten years, development team members have had significant and substantial involvement in the receipt of MA state funding and the closing of three or more affordable housing projects; and have experience with projects of similar scope, including legal, design, financing, and management; and have evidence of a high degree of success in securing necessary financing and other sources of funding in a timely manner.</p>	<p>In the last ten years, development team members have had significant and substantial involvement in the receipt of MA state funding and the closing of five or more affordable housing projects; and have experience with projects of similar scope, including legal, design, financing, and management; and have evidence of a high degree of success in securing necessary financing and other sources of funding in a timely manner.</p>

	UNACCEPTABLE	ACCEPTABLE	ADVANTAGEOUS	HIGHLY ADVANTAGEOUS
FINANCIAL FEASIBILITY				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Adequacy of proposed both development and operating budgets. • Availability and likelihood of approval of proposed pre-development, construction and permanent financing • Appropriateness of rents in relation to market and income restrictions proposed for each of the units. • Amount of funds to be leveraged from private and public sources is significant and feasible. 	<p>Proposal does not demonstrate an understanding of development costs and operating budgets for affordable housing and the proposed rents are not in line with Amherst market rents.</p>	<p>Proposal contains realistic development and operating budget. Proposal demonstrates an adequate degree of leveraging, realistic financing options and the proposed rents are in line with Amherst market rents.</p>	<p>Proposal contains realistic development and operating budgets. Proposal demonstrates a moderate degree of leveraging, achievable financing options and the proposed rents are in line with Amherst market rents.</p>	<p>Proposal contains realistic development and operating budgets. Proposal demonstrates a high degree of leveraging, achievable financing options and the proposed rents are very competitive with Amherst market rents.</p>

	UNACCEPTABLE	ACCEPTABLE	ADVANTAGEOUS	HIGHLY ADVANTAGEOUS
PROJECTED SCHEDULE				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The project's proposed timetable and the ability of the proponent to undertake, complete and market the project as presented. 	Proposal fails to provide a realistic and timely schedule for financing, design, approval, conveyance, construction start-up and completion, and marketing of units.	Proposal provides a thoughtful, detailed and realistic timeline for financing, design, approval, conveyance, construction start-up and completion, and marketing of units.	Proposal provides a thoughtful, detailed, and realistic timeline for financing, design, approval, conveyance, construction start-up and completion, and marketing of units. Proposer reasonably projects it can secure any required regulatory approvals and proceed with funding applications within 18 months of trust award.	Proposal provides a thoughtful, detailed, and realistic timeline for financing, design, approval, conveyance, construction start-up and completion, and marketing of units. Proposer reasonably projects it can secure any required regulatory approvals and proceed with funding applications within 12 months of trust award.

	UNACCEPTABLE	ACCEPTABLE	ADVANTAGEOUS	HIGHLY ADVANTAGEOUS
UNIT & BEDROOM CONFIGURATION				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A minimum of 15 affordable units • Mix of 1-3 bedroom units • At least 50% of the affordable units are 2+ bedrooms • A Minimum of 10% of the units are 3 bedrooms 	<p>Proposal fails to include a minimum of 15 affordable units and/or does not meet the 2+ bedroom requirement.</p>	<p>Proposal meets minimum affordable unit requirement and 50% of affordable units are 2+ bedrooms and 10% are 3 bedrooms.</p>	<p>Proposal exceeds minimum affordable unit requirement and is up to 24 units total; 60% of units are 2+ and at least 10% are 3 bedrooms.</p>	<p>Proposal exceeds minimum affordable units requirement and is greater than 24 unit total; 60% of units are 2+ bedrooms and at least 10% are 3 bedrooms.</p>

	UNACCEPTABLE	ACCEPTABLE	ADVANTAGEOUS	HIGHLY ADVANTAGEOUS
DEVELOPMENT DESIGN				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality and compatibility with Amherst’s character including site design and building massing (how well height above 3 stories is mitigated if applicable) • Realistic plan for either reusing or demolishing the East Street School • Creative design that is cost effective, attractive and high quality. • Development incorporates elements of green design and conservation of energy resources. • Easement to town for wetlands. 	<p>Proposal fails to articulate a thoughtful design concept and incorporate green building technology No plan for the East Street School was submitted.</p>	<p>Proposal articulates a compelling development vision that is cost-effective, has an attractive design, and incorporates elements of green design and conservation of energy resources. Adequate design for mitigating building massing. Realistic plan for either reusing or demolishing the East Street School.</p>	<p>Proposal articulates a compelling development vision that is cost-effective, attractive design, and ambitious application of elements of green design and conservation of energy resources. High quality design for mitigating building massing. Realistic plan for either reusing or demolishing the East Street School presented.</p>	<p>Proposal articulates a compelling development vision that is cost effective, has an attractive design and ambitious application of elements of green design and conservation of energy resources ; Excellent design for mitigating building massing. Realistic plan for either reusing or demolishing the East Street School presented.</p>

	UNACCEPTABLE	ACCEPTABLE	ADVANTAGEOUS	HIGHLY ADVANTAGEOUS
MANAGEMENT AND MAINTENANCE PLAN				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposal includes a plan for the ongoing management and maintenance of the development 	The proposal does not include a management and maintenance plan and does not identify a management agent.	The proposal includes a management and maintenance plan that identifies a management agent with experience successfully managing affordable housing.	The proposal includes a detailed management and maintenance plan and identifies a management agent that has up to 5 years of experience successfully managing affordable housing	The proposal includes a detailed management and maintenance plan and identifies a management agent that has more than 10 years of experience successfully managing affordable housing

	UNACCEPTABLE	ACCEPTABLE	ADVANTAGEOUS	HIGHLY ADVANTAGEOUS
COMMUNITY SUPPORT				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demonstrated experience successfully working with community groups, gaining public support, and addressing concerns effectively, as a means to the timely and successful completion of affordable housing developments 	<p>The development team has no experience in working with community groups on affordable housing and does not present a plan for working with the Amherst community.</p>	<p>The development team has limited experience in working with community groups on at least one successful project and presents a plan for working with the Amherst community.</p>	<p>The development team has worked with community groups on more than three successful projects and presents a reasonable plan for working with the Amherst community.</p>	<p>The development team has worked with community groups on more than five successful projects and presents a reasonable plan for working with the Amherst community.</p>

	UNACCEPTABLE	ACCEPTABLE	ADVANTAGEOUS	HIGHLY ADVANTAGEOUS
FAIR HOUSING AND EQUAL OPPORTUNITY				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Summary provided of the procedures planned for affirmative marketing and resident selection • Description of any fair housing or construction complaints issued against the Developer or members of the team in the last five years and what actions were taken to resolve the complaint 	No summary provided.	Summary and description provided and deemed adequate; any fair housing or construction complaints from the last five years were resolved.	Detailed summary provided and thorough; any fair housing or construction complaints from the last five years were resolved.	Detailed summary provided and thorough and no record of construction or fair housing complaints in the last five years.